

Calculations for Theorem 2
in ‘Competing auctions ...’
for Theoretical Economics 5 (2010)

Gabor Virag

April 18, 2010

Let us rewrite the key formula from the Appendix of the paper:

$$\begin{aligned}
\gamma'(a) = & -(n-1)\left(1 - \frac{1}{k}\right)^{n-2} \frac{1}{k} - \frac{(n-1)(n-2)}{k^2} af(a) \left(1 - \frac{1}{k}\right)^{n-3} + \\
& + \frac{(n-1)}{k} af(a) \left(1 - \frac{1}{k}\right)^{n-2} + \frac{n-1}{k(k-1)} r^* f(a) \left(1 - \frac{1}{k}\right)^{n-2} + \\
& + \frac{n-1}{k(k-1)} \left(1 - \frac{1}{k}\right)^{n-2} r^* f(a) + \frac{(n-1)(n-2)}{k^2(k-1)^2} \left(1 - \frac{1}{k}\right)^{n-3} r^* f(a) + \\
& + \frac{n-1}{k-1} \left(1 - \frac{1}{k}\right)^{n-2} - \frac{n-1}{k-1} af(a) \left(1 - \frac{1}{k}\right)^{n-2} + \frac{(n-1)(n-2)}{k(k-1)} af(a) \left(1 - \frac{1}{k}\right)^{n-3} - \\
& - \frac{n-1}{k-1} af(a) \left(1 - \frac{1}{k}\right)^{n-2} - \frac{n-1}{k-1} af(a) \frac{n-2}{k(k-1)} \left(1 - \frac{1}{k}\right)^{n-3}.
\end{aligned}$$

As we argued in that Appendix, we need to find a condition for $\gamma'(a) \leq 0$ to hold when one substitutes $r^* = \frac{a(n-1)}{(n-1)+(k-1)^2}$. We start with the observation that if one divides $\gamma'(a)$ through by $(n-1)\frac{1}{k}\left(1 - \frac{1}{k}\right)^{n-3}$, then the sign of the expression does not change, and thus we can look for conditions under which $\frac{\gamma'(a)}{(n-1)\frac{1}{k}\left(1 - \frac{1}{k}\right)^{n-3}} \leq 0$. After substituting $r^* = \frac{a(n-1)}{(n-1)+(k-1)^2}$, we can write that

$$\begin{aligned}
\frac{\gamma'(a)}{(n-1)\frac{1}{k}\left(1 - \frac{1}{k}\right)^{n-3}} = & -\left(1 - \frac{1}{k}\right) - \frac{n-2}{k} af(a) + af(a) \left(1 - \frac{1}{k}\right) + \\
& + \frac{(n-1)}{(n-1) + (k-1)^2} \frac{1}{k-1} \left(1 - \frac{1}{k}\right) af(a) + \frac{1 - \frac{1}{k}}{k-1} \frac{(n-1)}{(n-1) + (k-1)^2} af(a) + \\
& + \frac{n-2}{k(k-1)^2} \frac{(n-1)}{(n-1) + (k-1)^2} af(a) + \frac{k}{k-1} \left(1 - \frac{1}{k}\right) - \\
& - \frac{k}{k-1} af(a) \left(1 - \frac{1}{k}\right) + \frac{n-2}{k-1} af(a) - \frac{k}{k-1} af(a) \left(1 - \frac{1}{k}\right) - \frac{n-2}{(k-1)^2} af(a).
\end{aligned}$$

After collecting terms this expression becomes

$$\begin{aligned}
& \frac{\gamma'(a)}{(n-1)\frac{1}{k}(1-\frac{1}{k})^{n-3}} = \frac{1}{k} + \\
& + af(a)\left[-\frac{n-2}{k} + 1 - \frac{1}{k} + \frac{2}{k} \frac{(n-1)}{(n-1) + (k-1)^2} + \right. \\
& \left. + \frac{n-2}{k(k-1)^2} \frac{(n-1)}{(n-1) + (k-1)^2} - 1 + \frac{n-2}{k-1} - 1 - \frac{n-2}{(k-1)^2}\right] = \\
& = \frac{1}{k} + af(a)\left[-1 - \frac{1}{k} - \frac{n-2}{k(k-1)^2} + \right. \\
& \left. + \frac{n-2}{k(k-1)^2} \frac{(n-1)}{(n-1) + (k-1)^2} + \frac{2}{k} \frac{(n-1)}{(n-1) + (k-1)^2}\right] = \\
& = \frac{1}{k} + af(a)\left[-1 - \frac{1}{k} + \frac{\frac{2(n-1)}{k} - \frac{n-2}{k}}{(n-1) + (k-1)^2}\right] = \\
& = \frac{1}{k} + af(a)\left[-1 - \frac{1}{k} + \frac{n/k}{(n-1) + (k-1)^2}\right].
\end{aligned}$$

This expression to be nonpositive is equivalent to

$$af(a)\left[k + 1 - \frac{n}{(n-1) + (k-1)^2}\right] \geq 1$$

or

$$\begin{aligned}
af(a) & \geq \frac{1}{k + 1 - \frac{n}{(n-1) + (k-1)^2}} = \\
& = \frac{(n-1) + (k-1)^2}{(k+1)(n-1) + (k+1)(k-1)^2 - n} = \\
& = \frac{k(k-1) + n - k}{kn + n - k - 1 + k^3 - k^2 - k + 1 - n} = \\
& = \frac{k(k-1) + n - k}{k^3 - k^2 + k(n-2)} = \frac{k-1 + \frac{n-k}{k}}{k^2 - 2 + n - k},
\end{aligned}$$

which concludes the proof.